Health Care Reform Depends on Family Medicine: Walk softly BUT keep the stick close

Robert Phillips MD MSPH
The Robert Graham Center
Agenda

- Healthcare Reform about the Economy this time
- Primary Care seen as a solution
  - Lower costs, better population health
- Giving everyone insurance without sufficient access to primary care = EXPENSIVE
- Physician shortage? Poor Distribution? Both
- Primary Care Pipeline sprung a leak
- Now the stick
Why Health Reform Now?

"We suffer from a fiscal cancer… the real problem is health care costs."

U.S. Comptroller General David Walker

60 Minutes March 4, 2007

"We can't allow the cost of health care to continue strangling our economy."

President Obama April 15, 2009

"Over the long run, the deficit impact of every other fiscal policy variable is swamped by the impact of health-care costs."

By Peter R. Orszag

The Wall Street Journal

May 15, 2009

Health Costs Are the Real Deficit Threat

That's why President Obama is making health-care reform a priority.
The Curve We’re On

Spending on Health Care as a Percentage of Gross Domestic Product Under an Assumption That Excess Cost Growth Continues at Historical Averages

Source: CBO
Health Care Spending

- 16% of the US Economy ($2.3 trillion)

BUT

- From 2000 – 2005 healthcare devoured nearly 25% of our Economic Growth

- Now consumes 1/3rd of Federal and State Taxes
Healthcare Competes with Health

HEALTH, EDUCATION, AND DEFENSE SHARES OF U.S. GDP, 1955 - 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Healthcare</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Defense</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1955</td>
<td>4.3%</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>9.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>7.0%</td>
<td>7.3%</td>
<td>7.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>8.1%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>8.8%</td>
<td>6.6%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>10.1%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>12.0%</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>13.2%</td>
<td>7.5%</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>4.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
White House Strategy

- Keep Health Reform THE Priority

"We can't allow the cost of health care to continue strangling our economy."
President Obama April 14, 2009

"The cost of health care is crushing businesses and families"
Kathleen Sebelius, Secretary of HHS
May 5, 2009
Primary Care Ascendancy

“Overhaul of the health care system must not only provide for universal coverage but also for more primary care doctors and nurses to ensure that an insurance card actually gives the holder access to treatment.”

Rep. Henry Waxman

Hearing: Making Health Care Work for American Families: Improving Access to Care
March 24, 2009
"meaningful, comprehensive reform must increase the value placed on primary care and redefine the role that primary care provides in our health system... My own view is primary care docs have to be paid quite a bit more, and we are going to provide for that."

**Sen. Max Baucus**, chair
Senate Finance Committee
April, 2009
The Honorable Bernat Soria, MD PhD Health Minister of Spain
October 17, 2008 Patient Centered Primary Care Collaborative Summit, Washington, DC.
Primary-care score vs health outcomes

*Rank based on patient satisfaction, expenditures per person, 14 health indicators, and medications per person in Australia, Belgium, Canada, Denmark, Finland, Germany, Netherlands, Spain, Sweden, United Kingdom, United States

Spain’s Conversion: A Guide for the US?

- National Health System ---- 1986
- 1986--First Primary Care Health Center
- 2006--13,000 PC Health Centers
  - 1 : 1,350 = PC:population
- 8.4% of GDP
- 4th among the 19 most developed countries
  - Health Affairs (Health Affairs 27: 58-71 (2008);
- 6th among 191 countries
  - British Medical Journal (2001)

The Honorable Bernat Soria, MD PhD Health Minister of Spain

October 17, 2008 Patient Centered Primary Care Collaborative Summit, Washington, DC.
Current Contribution of Primary Care

- Only 5-6% of total expenditures in the current U.S. health care system are for primary care.

- In spite of this low level of investment, there is demonstrable positive impact:
  - Adults with an established relationship with a primary care physician had 33% lower costs of care, and were 19% less likely to die. (Starfield)

- The movement towards Patient Centered Medical Homes builds upon the current efficiency and quality of primary care practices...and improves them.
Strengthening Primary Care and Care Coordination in Medicare: Distribution of 10-Year Impact on Spending

Dollars in billions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Costs</th>
<th>Systemwide</th>
<th>Federal Gov't</th>
<th>State and Local Gov't</th>
<th>Private Payer</th>
<th>Households</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Savings</td>
<td>-$193.5</td>
<td>-$156.9</td>
<td>-$4.1</td>
<td>-$9.1</td>
<td>-$23.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why Primary Care? Massachusetts

- Percent uninsured 2003
  - Children: 7.6% 120,000
  - Adults: 12.7% 709,000
- Percent uninsured 2008: 3%
- 27% trouble with Access
  - Tremendous increase in ER use

http://www.kff.org/uninsured/upload/7451_04_Data_Tables.pdf
2008 Massachusetts Health Insurance Survey

Massachusetts Faces Costs of Big Health Care Plan

By KEVIN SACK
Published: March 15, 2009

BOSTON — Three years ago, Massachusetts enacted perhaps the boldest state health care experiment in American history, bringing near-universal coverage to the commonwealth with Paul Revere speed.

To make it happen, Democratic lawmakers and Gov. Mitt Romney, a Republican, made an expedient choice, deferring until another day any serious effort to control the state’s runaway cost growth.
Insuring Everyone

- Massachusetts cost model
  - Cost of care for all people currently without a usual source of care
    - $125 billion - $145 billion

- Enhanced PC cost model
  - Give everyone cost of Best 5 states:
    - Save $70 billion to Medicare
  - Give everyone cost outcomes of Community Health Centers: Save $450 billion
Need to build Primary Care Capacity Now

- So, with a higher per capita GDP, fewer uninsured and less rural-urban separation than Louisiana, Massachusetts has struggled to guarantee comprehensive primary care access for its population.
Considered by Congress Now/

- Primary Care Payment
- Primary Care Workforce
- Primary Care Extension Agent
- Patient Centered Medical Home
- Moving residency training into community
- Community Health Care Teams
PC Payment

- Senate Finance proposes 5% bonus on Medicare claims for docs who provide 60% of care in ambulatory settings
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposed Adjustment in allowed charges</th>
<th>% increase in average physician Medicare annual revenue</th>
<th>Family Medicine/GP</th>
<th>Family Medicine/GP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>$1,977</td>
<td>2.5% (0.68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25%</td>
<td></td>
<td>$9,884</td>
<td>12.5% (3.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50%</td>
<td></td>
<td>$19,768</td>
<td>24.9% (6.7%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$300 million $1.5 billion $2.9 billion
The Digestive System

Lobbyists start salivating.

Health Care Reform
Interest groups pulverize issue
Congressional hearings churn contents
Financial contributions produce digestive juices
Political opponents produce bile and invective
25 miles of committee hearings complete final compromise
You can guess the outcome

The system continues to run smoothly?
Greater numbers of family physicians per capita is associated with lower cost care. This association holds true even controlling for rural, poverty, poverty, education.
Is it too few physicians?

- 97,752 family physicians/general practitioners
  - 1 for every 3,081 persons
- 92,257 general internists
  - 1 per 2,443 adults
- 48,930 general pediatricians
  - 1 for 1,548 children and adolescents
- **238,939 primary care physicians**
  - 1 for every 1,260 persons
    - (one of all physicians per 454 persons)
Is it a Primary Care Shortage?

- **Problems:**
  - **Distribution**
    - Still concentrated in desirable areas
    - Relative shortage in underserved and rural areas
    - True for physicians, NPs and Pas
  - **Scope**
    - Primary care physicians performing non-primary care tasks to remain solvent
What lies ahead: Will there be a Primary Care Shortage?

- What’s to come:
  - Substantial decline in US student interest
  - Increased reliance on international students
  - Increased interest in specialization and alternative careers
  - Increased opportunity to specialize
  - Contraction of primary care training programs
  - Majority of PAs now subspecialize; NPs?

- Current physician expansion effort not promoting primary care
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specialty</th>
<th>Interest</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Internal Medicine</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Med/Peds</td>
<td>2.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Medicine</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Pediatrics</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total:</strong></td>
<td><strong>21.3%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

K. E. Hauer et al. Choices Regarding Internal Medicine Factors Associated With Medical Students' Career /JAMA. 2008;300(10):1154-1164
Status check: Family Medicine

Family Medicine Positions March, 2008

Filled by US Graduates
Proportion of third-year internal medical residents becoming subspecialists or hospitalists is growing

Note: MedPAC June 2008

Erosion of Primary Care Training Capacity

- Since 1996 GME cap was put in place in 1996, positions in the annual student Match have fallen by:
  - 57% for primary care internal medicine
  - 34% for primary care pediatric positions
  - 18% for family medicine
Primary care losing ground: GME

- Between 2002 and 2006
  - Residency positions grew +7.9%
  - Subspecialty positions grew +24.7%
    - (33% between 2001 and 2008)
  - Primary care positions grew +2.3%
  - Family Medicine positions fell -2.8%

- However...the estimated number of graduates going on to practice primary care fell 15% (from 28.1% to 23.8%)

Residency expansion

- Growth of specialty/subspecialty spots is bleeding primary care
- PC grads could fall to 17% of residency grads in next 5+ years
- COGME: Hospital incentives all wrong, bending GME to their financial needs
M. H. Ebell. Future Salary and US Residency Fill Rate Revisited. JAMA. 2008;300

Income Disparity affects Choice
True in 1989, true now
Is that a surprise?
Message to the Hill

- Primary Care cannot fulfill its role in Healthcare Reform if specialty income disparity and training models aren’t changed.
- Neither moves much by tweaking.
Family Medicine is Primary Care

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Adults Usual source of health care</th>
<th>Adjusted expenditures</th>
<th>Difference from FP/GP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Healthcare Expenditures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Medicine (FP/GP)</td>
<td>$2,753</td>
<td>Ref</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Internist (IM)</td>
<td>$3,734</td>
<td>$981*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Specialists</td>
<td>$3,521</td>
<td>$768*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Hospital clinic</td>
<td>$2,414</td>
<td>-$339*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital or other facility</td>
<td>$2,504</td>
<td>-$249*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has No USC</td>
<td>$865</td>
<td>-$1,888*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Primary-Careness” 60% threshold for Medicare bonus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>RGC Part B 2006 non-institutional only</th>
<th>MedPAC Part B 2006 institutional &amp; non-institutional</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geriatric Medicine</td>
<td>65.1%</td>
<td>65.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Medicine</td>
<td>58.4%</td>
<td>62.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal Medicine</td>
<td>38.9%</td>
<td>44.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pediatric Medicine</td>
<td>36.1%</td>
<td>36.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other physicians</td>
<td>17.4%</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
More “generalist” physicians per capita is associated with lower cost care

**EXHIBIT 9**
Relationship Between Provider Workforce And Medicare Spending: General Practitioners Per 10,000 And Spending Per Beneficiary In 2000

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General practitioners per 10,000</th>
<th>Spending per beneficiary (dollars)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>8,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>7,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>6,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SOURCES:** Medicare claims data and Area Resource File, 2002

Baicker and Chandra, Health Affairs April 2004
Lower Medicare spending correlated with FP/GP per population -- but not if GIM included

General Internists are more likely to locate like non-primary care specialists

Source: 2006 AMA Masterfile
Medicare Hospital (Part A) Expenditures Per Beneficiary, By Levels of GIM and Specialists

GIM Quintile (Low to High)

1. Lowest Specialist Quintile
2
3
4
5. Highest Specialist Quintile

Medicare Hospital (Part A) Expenditures Per Beneficiary, By Levels of FP and Specialists

FP Quintile (Low to High)

1. Lowest Specialist Quintile
2
3
4
5. Highest Specialist Quintile
The Stick

- Primary care payment policy is threatening
  - In a budget neutral Congress = food fight
  - Need to prevent primary care schism = bring general internal medicine along
  - Need to be strong in message and grassroots
- Friends are unwilling to lead
  - Key business leaders are cheerleading but looking to Congress, Medicare to lead
The Stick

Your Value is finally being recognized and may be rewarded...

You’ll need to enter the fray...

Bring a stick